Selling the Southwest: Native Arts and Identities

Bradley A. Finson, PhD
Researcher

Abstract

This article will examine the history of interaction between Anglos and South western Native artists, and the sense of identity that resulted from this during the early twentieth century. Aspects of this interaction that will be discussed are the influence exerted by various commercial interests, such as traders, curio dealers, anthropologists, collectors, the railroad, and tourism. The manner in which the Native arts accommodated Anglo tastes and market demands, as well as the level of success realized by Native Americans in maintaining and asserting their unique identities in spite of wholesale com modification by the larger society is integral to this examination.

Writing about the Taos Society of artists[1], William H. and William N. Goetzmann examined the allure the American Southwest and its indigenous peoples held in the minds of turn-of-the-century Americans. A yearning for the unspoiled primitive exerted its draw upon the minds and hearts of these individuals, tempering attitudes toward Native Americans in their 'pristine' condition. Goetzmann states:

For several of the Taos artists the essence of the Western experience was the contemplation of the American Indian. In numerous works by Couse, Sharp and Phillips, one finds the Native American stripped of the trappings of White culture. In these depictions of idealized, handsome models (one is tempted to say specimens), we see the painter's quest for the ideal image of "Indianness." No matter that the noble savage was a theme thoroughly exploited by previous generations of artists. Sharp and Couse both believed they had no higher calling than to *document, and at times recreate the fleeting vestiges of man in his natural state* (Italics mine).[23]

While Goetzmann's assessment of the Taos artists' efforts and aims was within a benign 'documentary' context, what was being documented along with the 'fleeting vestiges of man in his natural state' represents more than intellectuals' perceptions of subject matter expressed through artistic means. What drew artists to the sleepy hamlet of Taos early in the twentieth century was an opportunity to look back through time and savor an image of Indians based in centuries' old concepts.[4] The Taos artists actively engaged in creating and perpetuating an Indian identity firmly entrenched in the Anglo consciousness representing everything counter to the impersonal industrialized world they themselves sought to escape.

The allure for the Taos painters reflected an image of Native peoples that was at the same time safe and accessible. It became symbolic of what primeval man was perceived to be, a creature intimately one with nature's rhythms and a spirituality that modern society had lost. The identity created by the Taos Society artists reflected an on-going campaign to sell the Southwest to American tourists. The main players in the economic development of the region were the Atchison, Topeka, and Santa Fe Railroad and the Fred Harvey Company. The ATS&F's ace in the hole was none other than the Indian's splendidly pristine state, unsullied by civilization.

While the part played by the Taos artists and the Santa Fe Railroad might appear to have been separate and unrelated entities, the two became intimate bedfellows that promoted, marketed, and commodified Native peoples and cultures of the Southwest. Irving Couse's paintings became stock fodder for calendars produced by the ATS&F, presenting American consumers with romanticized depictions of Indians wearing pseudo-Plains clothing engaged in myriad ceremonial and spiritualized activities. Of particular note in the depictions was the element of Native arts that are represented. The pottery and textiles in Couse's and Joseph Henry Sharp's paintings highlighted a specific type of art that appealed to Anglo desires for a slice of Native culture. A visit to the Southwest afforded effete Easterners opportunity to lay claim to the timeless essence embodied in the "Other". This commercialization was not solely at the behest of the Santa Fe Railroad and the Fred Harvey Company, but was engaged in by traders, collectors, museums, and curio shop owners as well.

Southwest Native cultures had long dealt with other cultures seeking to impose a foreign way of life and value system, in their own interactions with one another, as well as dealings with Euro-Americans bent on remaking the land and its peoples over into their own image.

The history of contact between Native and non-Native societies represents a continuous series of interactions spanning nearly six centuries, and culminating in Anglo domination of the region. Consequently, two concurrent identities were presented to the larger society through these interactions. One realistically reflected who the Native peoples were according to their own ethnic identity, while the alternate perception presented a neatly packaged image depicting them as peoples without history, locked in time. All too frequently the latter eclipsed the former, and to a degree stills holds sway in the Anglo consciousness. Economic enterprises cannot be held entirely at fault, as they were fueled by the wants and desires of the American consumer, and Native peoples' willingness to accommodate these wants and desires for economic subsistence.

While relationships between Native arts traditions, tourism, and a market economy frequently created innumerable problems in regard to maintenance of cultural integrity and the perpetuation of stereotyped images, these same relationships also provided positive benefits for Native cultures, such as increased income for individuals, families, and entire communities.[5] Tourism provided an avenue for the expression of Native communities' cohesion and ethnic identity.

Consumerism became profoundly important in the way it solidified a particular conception of Native societies. This process was fostered through photography as early as 1871 during John Wesley Powell's survey of the Colorado River drainage. A young German named John K. Hillers accompanied Powell's expedition as official survey photographer, for the express purpose of documenting the region and its native inhabitants. Hillers primarily worked for organizations dedicated solely to "conveying information to various publics" throughout his twenty five year career, and his works were more widely disseminated and seen by more average people than the works of his peers.

Over the course of twenty five years Hillers made five trips into the West to photograph Native peoples and the land, with many of his works appearing in journals such as *Scribner's Magazine*, Bureau of Ethnology reports, Geological Survey reports, university press illustrations, commercial press publications, museum exhibits, as well as products manufactured by stereoscopic companies. Hiller's photographs were also featured in numerous public contexts such as the Philadelphia Exposition of 1876.[6] Hillers produced two separate series, the first focusing on the "wild" Indians, and the second concerned with the "Five Civilized Tribes" in the Indian Territory. While Hiller's work proved immensely popular, it was his first series that held the greatest appeal in the popular imagination. The second series portrays individuals wearing frock coats, bustle dresses, and did nothing to meet the skewed expectations of the Eastern concept of "Indian". As a result the first series was heavily promoted.

An example of the fare Hillers provided for Eastern audiences was a composition entitled *Group of Indians in Native Dress* dated 1873. While the Kaibab Paiute subjects are dressed in "native dress", they were posed in clothing Powell had in his collections in Marysville, Utah. Included were Ute clothing and feathered headdresses that Powell's sister had taught the Indians to make.[7] The irony of the piece is that the Paiutes and Utes were traditional enemies, yet any "Indian" clothing was deemed suitable to the purpose of depicting the exotic primitiveness of Hillers' subjects.

This pattern of depicting selective aspects of Native cultures was exploited most avidly by Edward Sheriff Curtis. Curtis, in the process of compiling his extravagant series of portfolios bearing the ponderous title of *The North America Indian, being a series of volumes picturing and describing the Indians of the United States and Alaska, written, illustrated, and published by Edward S. Curtis, edited by Frederick Webb Hodge, forward by Theodore Roosevelt, field research conducted under the patronage of J. Pierpont Morgan, in twenty volumes*[8]has probably exerted the single-most deleterious effect on popular images of Native peoples to date. In his introduction to Christopher M. Lyman's work on Curtis, Vine Deloria, Jr. points out that the Eastern conception during the period of what was "real Indianness" often collides with the known reality of today. Deloria states: "…to remark that Curtis posed his subjects – in some cases providing them with costumes after making them surrender their blue jeans and cowboy shirts – and frequently cropped his pictures to provide a different mood is to reveal one's profound ignorance of the Old West in many an Eastern sitting room decorated with Curtis' pictures."[9]

Photographers produced a com modified spectacle intended for middle class consumption through promotional materials in the form of calendars, post cards, brochures, and even playing cards. The illustrations gracing these materials emphasized the picturesque aspects of Indians, and were heavily Orientalized in tone. Barbara Babcock states that "the region is America's Orient."[10] Works such as the *Olla Maiden* post card produced by the Detroit Printing Company attest to this.

The figure of the Native American woman, clad in a blanket reminiscent of a burka certainly eschewed such ideals, and she became a major icon for the Fred Harvey Company's efforts at economic exploitation of the region and its peoples. The *Maiden* evoked a Biblical orient, the ancient and exotic. Added to this was the incessant overlay of an allegorical Plains Indian type. Together these elements portrayed the "*authentic"* Indian, with subjects from Arizona, California and New Mexico prominently featured in promotional materials.

The Fred Harvey Company's campaign to woo the tourist dollar was so successful that an entire chain of resort hotels sprang up in the Grand Canyon area. Among these were El Tovar and Hopi House, where the famous Hopi potter Nampeyo entered into the art world's spotlight. She and her family made pottery during the day in a reconstructed pueblo where tourists could observe them working. While this proved to be of great economic benefit for the Nampeyo family, it posed serious ramifications for Native values, privacy, and personal identity.

The Western penchant for an artist's signature pressured Nampeyo to begin signing her works, an aspect of artistic production entirely foreign to Native societies. In small scale, pre-literate cultures everyone knew everyone's works simply by stylistic attributes. Signing one's work went against Native American values of interdependence. Pottery bearing Nampeyo's signature came to be in such high demand that other members of her home pueblo began to follow suit, and this fostered an atmosphere of individualized competition rooted in a foreign concept and system.

Automobile side trips offered by the Harvey Company allowed visitors to travel to various hamlets and pueblos and catch an intimate glimpse into the everyday life of Native Americans. Drivers and Harvey Girl hostesses escorted groups of travelers hungry for a glimpse of the pristine primitives in their natural setting in much the same way that modern tourists take in exotic animal parks. Daily life in the pueblos was disrupted on a routine basis with little or no regard exercised for the privacy or dignity of the people. Native peoples were routinely viewed as "peaceful, pastoral people, living ruins from the childhood of civilization", objects of curiosity to be visually consumed.[11]

Prior to the railroad's incursion into the Southwest, the licensed trader became the vanguard of Anglo civilization and its values. The impact of trade exerted on Native cultures and economies has received wide attention and examination by a variety of scholars.[12] Initially traders exerted only a minimal impact on Native life-ways and world views, supplying items that Native peoples could pick and choose from according to their wants and needs, while at the same time selectively refusing those things that did not adhere to their world views. The relationship was one aptly characterized as hinging on discriminating eclecticism exercised by Native peoples.

Traders supplied items that were appealing to Southwestern peoples, and early on developed a savvy as to preferences on both ends of the market. In the same way that Native peoples desired commodities such as coffee, fruits, sugar, factory manufactured clothing, and commercially refined silver slugs, traders also exercised specific and well defined choices. Particular items, especially those bearing a ceremonial aura, were in demand, and traders actively sought to satisfy market demands for such. This carried with it connotations of dictating terms according to what the traders recognized as the most profitable arrangement for them at the expense of both ends of the market. Another consideration was the element of change introduced as Native commodities were tailored to the tastes and appetites of the Eastern market. Regarding this element of change among the Navajo, Robert S. McPherson commented:

> …In a free market economy where competition exists, the buyer has as much influence as the seller in determining the rate and flow of exchange. The question of whether the trader cheated the Navajo is not the issue here, but rather, whether the trader encouraged change. The answer, obviously, is yes. The location and organization of the post, the traffic in prehistoric artifacts, the marketing of wool and rugs, the establishment of the Shiprock fair, the construction of roads, and the employment of Navajos in a mixed barter and wage economy all emphasized White values in an Indian world.[13]

Far from being duplicitous pawns in the economic parley, the Navajos frequently travelled many miles to reach the trading posts which were situated with the convenience of the Navajos in mind. Trade was often conducted on the Navajos' terms. Over the years the balance shifted in favor of the trader as other elements impacted traditional life and the economy.

Initially trade was a peripheral affair for the Navajos until the mid to late twentieth century.[14] Prior to this time trade was largely centered around supplemental foodstuffs offsetting changes in subsistence patterns incurred through game depletion and loss of crops.

Another factor in trade was the replacement of items previously acquired through warfare and raiding. With the assertion of Anglo military force in the 1860s, raiding as an economic activity quickly diminished, and trade of wool and blankets for foodstuffs increased. Well into the twentieth century, trade with the Navajos followed patterns based in traditional models of generosity, reciprocity, and harmony, and Anglo traders gladly accommodated their clients' in order to acquire what the Eastern market demanded.

Among commodities produced for the market, weaving was perhaps the most prominent and pertinent. Weaving was an adopted element that held no long standing significance in Navajo culture. Like silversmithing, weaving represents a relatively late addition to the Navajo artistic repertoire. It was not until after the interment at Bosque Redondo in 1863 to 1868 that the Navajo began capitalizing on weaving to replace other avenues of subsistence denied them by enforced confinement. In marked contrast to the Rio Grande pueblos for whom weaving was an integral part of life and culture, the Navajo acquired this skill very late in their experience in the Southwest, yet it was, and still is, seen as quintessentially Navajo.

Woven articles in Puebloan cultures are integrated into their culture as elements of ceremony, marriage exchanges, mortuary practice, and as identifiers of place within society and the universe. The Puebloan conception of the textile arts' rolein culture differs from Navajo conceptions of commodity. The closed character of Hopi, Zuni, and other Puebloan cultures has been instrumental in preventing an overt intrusion by outsiders viewing textiles with an eye on acquisition of the exotic. Careful guarding of ceremonies and private life has precluded the textile arts from being subsumed as tourist fare.

For Puebloan peoples many textiles embody deep-seated cosmological associations. Design motifs in textiles such as kilts, belts, sashes, and other items of ceremonial clothing bear direct relationship to cosmological elements rooted in centuries' old traditions. Rain clouds, lightning, and other water-based motifs represent a corpus of belief, reliance, and acknowledgement of elemental forces that has a centuries' long manifestation. This is exhibited in kiva murals from several sites, such as Kua-ua and Awatovi, as well in painting traditions from the early twentieth century. Kate Peck Kent comments on this in stating:

The manufacture of many traditional articles continues among the Hopi...The practice of weaving traditional items with an eye to selling them to white buyers does not appear to have operated as a factor in their survival. With the exception of the brocaded dance sash-modified to be suitable as a table runner, few concessions were made to white taste.

The rich designs and motifs produced for use in ceremonial garments were markers of identity that were not intended for economic exploitation, and openly making these available to peoples outside the culture was simply not an option. Strict prohibitions were, and are still maintained to prevent this. Making these no more than commodities undermines their 'sacredness', and invites potentially hazardous spiritual implications for the maker and the community at large. In contrast, weaving was peripheral to Navajo culture, and was utilized as an economic link with other peoples. Because of the stress on weaving's commercial applications, Navajo weaving has thrived on innovation, change, and outside influences.

Despite the commercial orientation of Navajo weaving, there are and have been certain areas that receive criticism by the Navajo elders. Of particular concern are Yei rugs and textiles, and paintings with elements of dry painting.[15] Navajo elders sharply criticize the use of these representations in works destined for the tourist market as they demean and cheapen Navajo beliefs essential to the maintenance of *Ho' zho*, the balance and harmony between man and the universe.[16]

Strictures placed on 'sacred' imagery are rigidly adhered to in the main. Illustrating this are the works of Curtis Benally, a Navajo painter/Installation artist, and the experience of Edward S. Curtis. Benally creates large scale canvass-installations incorporating elements inspired by dry paintings.

The artist exercises strict care in submitting preliminary drawings of his works to the elders before he begins the physical work to avoid any infringement on privileged cultural information.[17] Curtis' interaction with Navajo men revolved around the creation and photographing of *Yei Bichai* masks for a short film he was producing. The Navajos purposely altered the masks they created out of a sense of cultural propriety. Ignorant of such, Curtis accepted the masks as genuine. Mark Gridley commented on this episode in stating: "…present day Navajos knowledgeable about the Yei Bichai, when shown film footage or still images of the ceremony depicted, wryly point out that their forebears did everything backwards to avoid tribal restrictions against recording sacred rites."[18]

Despite the occasional transgression, accessions to White tastes by Navajo artisans were done so*with their complicity* as opposed to these being unduly exerted on them. Regardless of the commercial nature of the tourist art and the adoptive status that many of these forms has among the Navajos, they nevertheless utilized art as a means of solidifying a sense of cultural identity. This has been done through the basic approach to the working process itself. Reichard states:

Handcraftsmanship must be reckoned not only in dollars and cents but also in satisfaction. There is something about making a beautiful object which cannot be measured tangibly. There is no doubt that the weavers feel this…Their artisanship is to them a pride and joy. They try to get as much money as they can for it, but that is a matter distinct from their aesthetic reward.

The element of cultural maintenance in Navajo works is directed through the shaping force in the universe, and is paramount in their conception of who they are as a people. The conceptual element assumes greater importance than the physical results from the artist's hand. The finished work merely bears testimony to one's part and place in the universal whole. The peripheral nature of textiles and silversmithing provided ready income augmenting changing subsistence patterns, and provided commodities that appealed to Anglo tastes for the exotic. The railroads spread like tentacles across previously inaccessible reaches of the Navajo homeland and provided Eastern Americans reasonably safe and easy access to an "exotic" way of life,and allowed Anglos to vicariously claim a part of the Other's culture by acquiring "authentic" articles espousing a simpler, purer way of life than that found in twentieth-century Anglo society.

While cultural integrity was maintained in some areas of visual expression, the influence of traders and institutional interests, such as museums, exerted pressures in other areas of the arts, specifically basketry. Basketry was a form of expression that was largely reserved for ceremonial contexts until relatively late in the twentieth century. The 'discovery' of Navajo basketry by collectors and ethnologists from the Museum of Northern Arizona provided an economic incentive that soon placed basketry outside a ceremonial context and firmly within the realm of economic gain.

The renaissance of traditional Navajo basketry was nothing more than a concerted effort by White traders and collectors to capitalize on a particular type of basket known as *ts' aa'*, coiled basketry trays. The designs for these trays were given by the Holy People, and embodied aspects of sacred tradition. The continued production of these today is in part attributed to ritual specific needs. As a consumer item manufacture of these trays nearly died out in the 1930s due to an emphasis placed on blankets. A reversal came about in the 1950s with an interest in the form fueled by William Beaver and Virginia Chin Smith, the daughter of Stokes Carson, a trader operating out of the Oljeto Trading Post.[19]

Both Beaver and Smith began collecting basketry trays with unusual designs and displayed examples in 'museum rooms', allocated spaces in trading posts for the display of both prehistoric and contemporary art and artifacts. Smith particularly seems to have been instrumental in revitalizing the art, encouraging makers to experiment with new designs and fostering a secularization of the stories the baskets embodied as a means to meet Anglo demands for "sacred art".

New designs came into being, including images of animals, geometric patterns based on late nineteenth-century textile designs, and *Yei bichai* figures. The designs woven into trays featured secular narratives derived from mythical themes that continue to operate today as templates for cultural continuity. In response to Anglo demands for "sacred" art, basket makers created forms and designs based on sacred themes, yet created imagery quite separate and distinct from sacred imagery, with the exception of *Yei bichais*. In doing so, artists maintained cultural integrity by supplying articles that satisfied market trends without transgressing cultural strictures. Similar efforts at maintaining cultural integrity have been exercised by the Hopis in the form of katsinas.

Katsina dolls are a ubiquitous item in museum collections and grace innumerable mantles in Anglo America. The 'dolls' are actually fanciful creations geared toward satisfying a desire on the part of the dominant culture.

Katsina figures made for the tourist market bear little resemblance to the actual katsinas that inhabit the six-month ceremonial cycle of the Hopis, but are instead composites and altered forms, fictive creations posing no threat of transgressing cultural or religious prohibitions. There is enough in their forms to suggest the sacred, yet minute features, such as feathers, eye shapes, and accoutrements are altered. The actual katsina is not represented visually, but instead the *idea* of a katsina is presented, with enough suggestion of the sacred to satisfy tourists' desires to own something exotic.

Tawaquaptewa, a well-known maker of katsina dolls during the early twentieth century, excelled in created altered forms that evoked a sense of the sacred. Barton Wright, an expert on katsinas states:

As *kikmongwi* [a political-religious leader], Tawaqueptewa had a special relationship to all katsinas. He had knowledge of and responsibility for the katsinas that no one else had…With that privilege went a duty and a responsibility, and a traditional proscription, that the Kikmongwi do nothing in relation to the katsinas that would be improper or disrespectful. Therefore, to use katsinas, or the carved representations of them, in any way that was commercially exploitive or opportunistic would be unthinkable.

The inference in the quote is clear: Tawaquaptewa purposely altered forms to avoid representing actual katsinas, thereby protecting culturally sensitive knowledge from outsiders' intrusiveness. He satisfied consumers' appetite for the exotic while maintaining sensitive knowledge integral to Hopi identity.

Coping skills and cultural maintenance, including tactics and techniques of management in response to inquisitive Anglo visitors and clientele, as in times past is still ongoing. Several modes of behavior were enjoined as a mean of coping with Euro-American intrusiveness and insuring the protection of privileged information. In the same manner that Tawaqueptewa altered katsinas, the secularization of Navajo basketry and restrictions placed on visitors' access to ceremonies provided safeguards.

Jill A. Sweet undertook a study of the techniques developed by the San Juan and Acoma pueblos in dealing with the problem of intrusiveness.[20] While some of the ceremonies are open to the public, there are others that are restricted. Sweet states:

In the 1930s, the United Pueblos Agency, the centralized federal administration of all New Mexico pueblos, acknowledged 'that matters of purely internal nature were the exclusive jurisdiction of Pueblo officials. Relevant to tourism, Pueblo officials have the right to exclude visitors and to set the rules for acceptable behavior. They have the right to close the village to outsiders at any time. They also have the right to police their reservations and enforce their regulations. In short, the Pueblo communities determine what tourists may do or see while on the reservation and whether or not tourism will be encouraged, simply tolerated, or discouraged.

A second method of protecting and maintaining cultural integrity is secrecy. Asking direct questions is considered to be rude behavior in Pueblo societies, as divulging privileged information can lead to a loss of power. Talking about a ceremony or belief openly may diminish that ceremony's efficacy, and the risk increases when information is given to an outsider. This results in a marked reticence to answer questions, and provides a measure of power and control over outsiders, in effect reversing the sphere of dominance.

By controlling privileged information the Puebloans exert control over something that tourists want, the knowledge of exotic cultures. Sweet quotes one Pueblo official as saying that"…control of Knowledge distances us from them and is central to the socially supported and on-going maintenance of culture. Pueblo secrecy is not simply a cultural quirk, but rather, a deeply embedded technique for cultural survival".[21] Four significant factors contribute to success in maintaining cultural integrity: time, space, type of contact, and the level of self-determination that is operative.[22]In regard to time, tourism's relatively slow development allowed the Pueblos time to adjust to the new outsiders. The isolation and buffering of the pueblos by the landscape precluded them from being entirely engulfed by tourists. The type of contact being one-on-one versus mass contact resulted in a more positive encounter, with individual Anglos often acting as a cultural broker in circumstances of difficulty with the wider aspects of Anglo society. And, finally, the level of self-determination exercised by Puebloan peoples allowed them to define their world in their own terms, enabling them to actively form their relationship with outsiders.

An example of the effective manner in which the Taos people deal with outsiders involves three specific factors: perceptions of the Taos people by Anglos; adjustment to tourism, and; the exploitive nature of the relationship with the town of Taos. The 'underground' practice of religious rites and ceremonies is cited as a response to the often brutal efforts to assimilate Native peoples throughout their history of interaction with Euro-Americans. The town of Taos, whose economy is largely dependent on Taos Pueblo, is seen as parasitic by Puebloans who admit to their own ethnocentrism. Operating in two directions, the inaccurate stereotypes between both groups are enhanced by encounters that are brief and superficial.[23]

Carol Chiago Lujan found that many individuals admit to the economic necessity of tourism, but feel they are "viewed as a living museum and are constantly bombarded with questions."

Respondents to Lujan's interviews cited the incidence of tourists' intrusive behaviors, interrupting daily activities, generating and perpetuating cultural stereotypes, and displaying gross disrespect by taking pictures without permission. Such activity led to the closing of the Hopi towns during the performance of the Snake Dance in the 1930s after the ceremony became a circus event for Anglo sightseers. The displeasure of the people is evidenced in some of Sumner Matteson's photographs in which participants, visibly disturbed by his presence, can be seen snarling at the camera.

Taos Pueblo officials have placed a number of restrictions on tourists, such as setting admission times and fees, and various rules and regulations to be followed as well as general information about the pueblo. Tours of the village are conducted by members of the community. Despite the obvious economic benefits, Taos Pueblo residents nevertheless feel that tourism exacerbates cultural differences rather than alleviating them.

Aggressive trafficking in art works was undertaken by curio shops at the turn of the century. Taking advantage of a niche in the market, a number of individuals actively mined sites for grave goods, ancient pottery, and virtually anything else determined to be of saleable value. Together with wares and articles produced by Native peoples, proprietors of curio shops fed a steady stream of objects to collection hungry individuals and institutions alike.

Moses Aaron and Jake Gold established an "Indian pottery and curiosity shop" in Santa Fe in 1882, claiming to be the only outlet in the region offering Indian pottery for sale.[24] This idea quickly caught on with others, and within a few years curio dealers abounded in Santa Fe for the express purpose of satisfying tourists' appetites. Aaron Gold was far sighted enough not only to capitalize on the influx of tourists in the region, but established an outside market with Eastern customers through mail order, publishing small, non-descript sales catalogues highlighting pottery.

Gold's corner on the mail order business was short-lived, however, as others quickly seized on the idea as well. W. G. Walsh, an El Paso businessman, purchased land near the railroad depot in Santa Fe, set up shop and began offering selections of objects "made by Apaches, Puebloans, and other peoples.[25] Gold and Walsh were soon competing with another El Paso entrepreneur, Jesus Sito Canelario, known as a "practical joker and teller of tall tales, who would fabricate wonderful [sic fantastic] stories in order to sell his curios.[26] By 1901 Candelario was mass producing Pueblo Indian artifacts. Items included clubs decorated with beads that were billed as "Pueblo war clubs", but were of a type widely used by non-Puebloans as well. "Squaw rattles", "well made and grotesquely painted" constituted another segment of the inventory, attesting to the demand for "authenticity" by buyers.

Francis E. Lester, from El Paso, established a weaving industry among the Tewas. One of Lester's catalogues states: "We conceived of the idea of selling high grade Pueblo rugs of New Mexico direct from the maker to the customer. Since that time we have labored with the Pueblo Indians of the Rio Grande Valley in an effort to restore their art of blanket weaving to its high standard of a century ago."[27] The reality of the industry as it existed a century earlier was that, while woven articles were esteemed in a ceremonial context, the Tewas were not responsible for the majority of their textiles. Instead, these were produced by Hopi and Zuni weavers.[28]This sales propaganda created a mystique ensuring items' appeal to both tourists and the Eastern market.

One of the more popular items available in curio shops were clay figurines produced in Cochiti. While pottery production represents a 'traditional' endeavor at Cochiti, the figurines represented a means by which the Indians recorded their impressions of outsiders in a tongue and cheek manner. Cheri Falkenstein Doyle comments:

"One response of Native peoples everywhere to invasion and oppression by the white man is to represent him in inverse and ludicrous forms.

To mock, to caricature, and laugh at the light-skinned aliens in stories, pantomimes, and in the visual arts is to symbolically appropriate if not negate his threatening power and inevitable presence."[29] Other scholars believe that Cochiti figurines were inspired by Anglo businessmen seen coming in on trains. This idea of parody is not new to Peubloans, who routinely embraced burlesque as a means of reinforcing cultural standards of behavior as well as coping with strangers. The Cochiti figurines can be likened to *koshares,* ritual clowns. The tradition of *koshares* has a long and honored history in ceremonies of Puebloan peoples as a way to insure proper social behavior. An aspect of *koshare* performance is to parody Mexicans, Americans, and Navajos. The full blown appearance of the clay figurines coincides with the peak of Anglo immigration into New Mexico circa 1870-1880, when the Anglo population increased by nearly ninety percent.

As a matter of boosterism New Mexican officials hosted Santa Fe's Tertio Millenial Anniversary Character Celebration in 1883 as a means of courting statehood.[30]

The purpose of the event was to show the distinct and separate natures of New Mexico's three cultures, American, Hispanic, and Native American. Scheduled events highlighted each group's contributions and required participation by many Native inhabitants. The event drew a number of Puebloan people to Santa Fe where they sold their wares to curio dealers. Among the wares brought to the festival were Cochiti figurines. Sometimes termed souvenir art, the figurines are seen by some as a form of indigenous anthropological undertaking. Doyle quotes anthropologist Ruth Philips as stating:

Souvenir art is the product of careful, anthropological study of the material culture and aesthetics of the Western other by Native artists and craftspeople… Cochiti potters observed all kinds of people with whom they came into contact, and they recorded their impressions of them in clay in a way that communicates amusement, criticism, or simply an active interest in the rapidly changing local scene. Because the figurines were… made for sale to some of the same outsiders they portrayed, potters had to develop a keen understanding of what their targeted audience, the Western other, would understand, appreciate, and buy.

The period of peak production for the figurines was 1880 to 1920, followed by a sharp decrease in manufacture. The incidence of decline can in large part be ascribed to anthropologists and museum curators who decried them as worthless from a scientific and ethnological standpoint. They sought early examples of pre-contact works for their studies and collections, and exerted considerable influence on what Puebloan peoples created. The figurines themselves were developed in response to tourists' demands, providing a partial livelihood for artists. Because of the worthless value placed on them by institutions such as the Museum of New Mexico, the growing art community in Santa Fe, and ethnologists, after 1920 there was a return to more "traditional" forms that accommodated Primitivist ideals that prevailed during the period. The net result was the discouragement of new forms and techniques in the Native arts.

With the entry of the railroad and the advent of commercial tourism after 1880, a marked demand for Native arts increased. Old forms were revived and/or modified to accommodate this market. Navajo weavers shifted from blankets to rugs, basket making in non-utile forms became prevalent, and many artists found themselves engaged in what amounted to a feudal relationship wherein they were provided with basic amenities of life in exchange for exclusive rights to their wares by traders and curio dealers. By the 1890s there was a proliferation of hastily made curios with non-traditional designs to satisfy market demands, yet in spite of this Native artists maintained superior craftsmanship. Jewelry became an important economic factor at pueblos such as Zuni, where small fetishes became common tourist far, as did woven basketry hats and clothes hampers made by the Jicarilla Apaches. Such overt influences sought to freeze Native Americans in time, casting them as people outside of history in order to perpetuate and preserve an Anglo perception of their identity.

Despite these influences, Native peoples exercised resiliency and determination in the face of a pervasively acquisitive society. Changes that were necessary to accommodate the new invaders were undertaken without sacrificing cultural values or undermining world views. In spite of an economic relationship that predominantly favored Anglos, Native artists capitalized on the situation as a catalyst for reinforcing and substantiating their sense of identity as separate and distinct cultures. The inequities of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries have passed into history as another footnote that bears witness to the exploitation of peoples at the hand of a colonial power. Today, in large part due to Anglo meddling and manipulation, the Native arts enjoy widespread popularity and maintain a tradition of innovation, experimentation, and vitality that has become their hallmark.

Notes

[1]The Taos Society of Artists, established in 1915 in Taos, New Mexico, included as its original members Ernest Blumenschein, Bert Phillips, Joseph Henry Sharp, and Irving Couse. The Society later expanded its orbit to include a number of influential writers, composers and intellectuals who helped to shape the culture of early twentieth-century America, such as D. H. Lawrence, Mary Austin, Alfred Stiglitz, Leopold Stowkowski, and a host of others. Their main premise was to create a venue for the exhibition and sale of Society members' work, and became, Goetzmann's terms, "the prime translator of a rarified Western experience which saw the environment and its peoples through eyes nurtured by the highest level of artistic training, and minds enriched by everything from revolutionary politics, to …literature…"

[2] William H. Goetzmann, and William N. Goetzmann. *The West of the Imagination.* New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1986. 357.

[3]

[4] See Margaret Hodgen, *Earl Anthropology in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1964, and Rayna Diane Green, *The Only Good Indian: Images of Indians in American Vernacular Culture*. Ph. D. Dissertation, Indiana State University, 1973 for excellent treatments of the precedents and subsequent development of Euro-American conceptions of the "Other".

[5] Gail Sheffield. *The Arbitrary Indian.* Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1997. 21, 22.

[6] Don D. Fowler. *The Western Photographs of John K. Hillers: Myself n the Water*. Washington, D. C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1989. 61.

[7] Fowler. *Myself in the Water.* 48.

[8] Edward Sheriff Curtis. *The North American Indian*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: University Press of Cambridge, 1907-1930.

[9] Vine Deloria, Jr. quoted in Christopher M. Lyman. *The Vanishing Race and Other Illusions.* Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1982. 12.

[10] Barbara Babcock. Quoted in Leah Dilworth. *Imaging Indians in the Southwest: Persistent Visions of a Primitive Past.* Washington, D.C.: Smithsonnian Institution Press, 1996. 58.

[11] Leah Dilworth. *Imaging Indians.* 79.

[12] Richard White. *The Roots of Dependency: Subsistence, Environment, and Social Change Among the Choctaws, Pawnees, and Navajos.* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press; *The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1610-1815.* New York: Cambridge University Press, 1991; Stanley Noyes. *Los Comanches: The Horse People, 1751-1845.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1993; Michael G. Davis. *Ecology, Sociopolitical Organization, and Change on the Sothern Plains.* Kirksville, MO.: Thomas Jefferson University Press, 1996.

[13] Robert S. McPherson. "Naaley'he' Ba' Hooghan: "House of Merchandise":The Navajo Trading Post as an institution of Cultural Change." In *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 16:1 (1992). 40.

[14] Richard White. *Roots of Dependency.* 240.

[15] The commonly accepted term fot hese works is "sand paintings", yet this is a misnomer. These works, used in healing ceremonies, are comprised of a variety of dry materials, including not only sand, but corn and flower pollens, charcoal, and ground minerals. Because of this, a more appropriate term is 'dry painting'.

[16] For a thorough an complete explanation of the concept, reference Gary Witherspoon's *Language and Art in the Navajo Universe*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1977.

[17] Curtis Benally. Dene' Artist. Personal communication, Norman , Oklahoma, 1998.

[18] Mark Gidley. *Edward S. Curtis And the North American Indian, Inc.* Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 1998. 101.

[19] Susan Brown McGreevy. "Embellishing the Spiral: Design Developments in Navajo Baskets." In *American Indian Art magazine* 23:4 (Summer, 1999). 44-53.

[20] Jill A. Sweet. "Let 'em Loose!: Pueblo Indian Management of Tourism." In *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 15:4 (1991). 59-74.

[21] Sweet. 67.

[22] Sweet. 72.

[23] Carol Chiago Lujan. "A Sociological View of Tourism in an American Indian Community: Maintaining Cultural Integrity at Taos Pueblo." In *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 17:3 (1993). 101-120

Books

Curtis, Edward Sheriff. The North American Indian being a series of volumes picturing and describing the Indians of the United States and Alaska, written, illustrated, and published by Edward S. Curtis, edited by Frederick Webb Hodge, forward by Theodore Roosevelt, field research conducted under the patronage of J. Pierpont Morgan, in twenty volumes. Cambridge, MA: University of Cambridge Press, 1907-1930.

Davis, Michael G. Ecology, Sociopolitical Organization, and Change on the Southern Plains. Kirksville, MO: Thomas Jefferson University Press, 1996.

Dilworth, Leah. Imaging Indians in the Southwest: Persistent Visions of a Primitive Past. Washington, D.C.:
Smithsonian Institution Press, 1996.

Fowler, Don D. The Western Photographs of John K. Hillers: Myself in the Water. Washington, D.C.: SmithsonianInstitution Press, 1989.

Gidley, Mark. Edward S. Curtis and the North American Indian, Inc. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 1998.

Goetzmann, William H. and William N. The West of the Imagination. New York: W. W. Norton $ Company, 1986.

Hodgen, Margaret. Early Anthropology in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1964.

Lyman, Christopher M. The Vanishing Race and Other Illusions. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press,1982.

Noyes, Stanley. Los Comanches: The Horse People, 1751-1845. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1993.

Sheffield, Gail K. The Arbitrary Indian: The Indian Arts and Crafts Act of 1990. Norman: University of OklahomaPress, 1997.

Taschen, Benedikt, ed. Edward S. Curtis. The North American Indian: The Complete Portfolios. Translated by RolfeFricke. New York: Taschen, 1997.

White, Richard. The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650-1815. NewYork: Cambridge University Press, 1991.

The Roots of Dependency: Subsistence, Environment, and Social Change Among the Choctaws, Pawnees, and Navajos. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989.

Journals and Articles

Batkin, Jonathan. “Some Early Curio Dealers in New Mexico.” In American Indian Art magazine 23:3 (Summer,1998). 68-80.

Brody, J. J. “The Creative Consumer: Survival, Revival, and Invention in Southwest Indian Arts.” In Nelson H. H.Graburn. Ethnic and Tourist Arts: Cultural Expressions for the Fourth World. Berkeley: University of CaliforniaPress, 1976.

Cohodas, Marvin. “Washoe Innovators and Their Patrons. “ In Edwin L. Wade, ed. The Arts of the North American Indian: Native Traditions in Evolution. New York: Hudson Hills Press, 1986.

Doyle, Cheri Falkenstein. “Cochiti Ceramic Figurines 1880-1915: Possible Sources of Inspiration.” In American Indian Art magazine 24:4 (Autumn, 1999). 38-47.

Kent, Kate Peck. “Pueblo and Navajo Weaving Traditions and the Western World.” In Nelson H. H. Graburn, ed.
Ethnic and Tourist Arts: Cultural Expressions for the Fourth World. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976.

Lujan, Carol Chicago. “A Sociological View of Tourism in an American Indian Community: Maintaining Cultural
Integrity at Taos Pueblo.” In American Indian Culture and Research Journal 17:3 (1993). 101-120.

McGreevy, Susan Brown. “Embellishing the Spiral: Design Developments in Navajo Baskets.” In American IndianArt magazine 23:4 (Summer, 1999). 44-53.

McPherson, Robert S. "Naalye'he'Ba'Hoogan: 'House of Merchandise': The Navajo Trading Post as an Institutionof Cultural Change.": In American Indian Culture and Research Journal 16:1 (1992). 23-43.

Sweet, Jill A. "Let 'em Loose! Pueblo Management of Tourism." In American Indian Culture and Research Journal15:4 (1991). 59-74.

Walsh, Barry. "Kikmongwi as Artist: The Katsina Dolls of Wilson Tawaquaptewa." In American Indian Art magazine 24:1 (Winter, 1998). 52-59.

Dissertations and Theses

Green, Rayna Diane. The Only Good Indian: Images of the Indian in American Vernacular Culture. Ph. D. Dissertation, Indiana State University, 1973.

Interviews

Benally, Curtis, Dine' artist. Personal communication, Norman, Oklahoma, 1998.

[24] Jonathan Batkin. "Some Early Curio Dealers of New Mexico." In American Indian Art magazine 23:3 (Summer, 1998). 72.

[25] Ibid.

[26] Batkin,. "Some Early Curio Dealers of New Mexico". 74.

[27] Ibid.

[28] J. J. Brody. "The Creative Consumer: Survival, Revival, and Invention in the Southwest Indian Arts." In Nelson H. H. Graburn, ed. Ethnic and Tourist Arts: Cultural Expressions for the Fourth World. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976. 89.

[29]Cheri Falkenstein Doyle. "Cochiti Ceramic Figurines 1880-1915: Possible Sources of Inspiration." In American Indian Art magazine 24:4 (Autumn, 1999). 38.

[30] Doyle. "Cochiti Ceramic Figurines." 40.